

## Waldemar Kmentt



### Franz Schubert: Mass No. 6 in E-flat major, D 950

Franz Schubert

SACD aud 92.541

[Der neue Merker](#) Nr. 116 (Dorothea Zweipfennig - 2005.07.01)



Schuberts Es-Dur Messe entstand in seinem letzten Lebensjahr 1828. Auch wenn...

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

[klassik.com](#) November 2005 (Miquel Cabruja - 2005.11.04)

source: <http://magazin.klassik.com/reviews/revie...>



Licht und Schatten

Licht und Schatten

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

[www.classicstodayfrance.com](#) Novembre 2005 (Christophe Huss - 2005.11.01)



Rafael Kubelik a de la Messe en mi bémol une vision dramatique (cf. les cuivres...

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

[www.musicweb-international.com](#) January 2006 (John Quinn - 2006.01.03)



The Audite label continues to put collectors in their debt by issuing live performances conducted by Rafael Kubelik. This issue is particularly valuable since I can't immediately recall many instances of commercial recordings of Schubert's music by Kubelik.

There is much fine music in this Mass setting, one of the two most substantial that Schubert composed. I regret that there's not more for the soloists to do. They don't feature at all until the Credo, and then in a limited way, after which they have more to do in the Benedictus and Agnus Dei. Kubelik's team make the most of their relatively limited opportunities to shine. This Mass is a substantial composition in which most of the musical argument is carried by the chorus. Schubert could have pruned it a bit, especially in the

Gloria and Credo, without sacrificing much.

In this performance the Kyrie flows nicely. The Gloria starts strongly and Kubelik and his forces make good use of dynamic contrast. I was glad, but not surprised, to find that Kubelik keeps the music moving forward nicely. For my money, however, there are some excessively repetitious passages. The central section of the Gloria, starting at 'Domine Deus' (4:41 in this reading) is dramatic and the Bavarian trombones ring out assertively and darkly. The music is quite jagged at times and Kubelik makes the most of this. But surely Schubert extends this section too much? In even this well paced performance the section lasts over four minutes and I find my attention wandered a bit. Equally, the fugue with which the Gloria rather predictably concludes is too extensive. I like Kubelik's sprightly pacing, despite which his choir articulates the notes well, but even so three and a half minutes is a trifle excessive for the material.

The soloists finally get involved – or some of them do – in an andante terzetto in the Credo at 'Et incarnatus est' When I first heard this performance I thought the section sounded a bit laboured. But the tempo is virtually identical to that adopted by Wolfgang Sawallisch in his fine 1980 EMI recording, by coincidence also with the Bavarian choir and orchestra. A comparative listening exercise suggested to me that the reason that the passage sounds better under Sawallisch is because his soloists phrase the music more lightly and imaginatively. The musical material for this section is echt-Schubert but for all its merits I do wonder if he should have indulged in a repetition of the music after the choir has sung 'Crucifixus etiam pro nobis'. Apart from any musical considerations the repetition of 'Et incarnatus' at this point makes no textual sense. As in the Gloria this movement concludes with a fugue, lasting this time for some four minutes. Once again I found myself wishing that Schubert had edited his material – and it's an exacting sing for the chorus as I know from personal experience. However, Kubelik's choir delivers it very well.

The opening of the Sanctus is majestic in Kubelik's hands. The lively 'Osanna' is well sung; the choir demonstrates, as they do throughout the piece, lots of commitment and they sing with good, unforced tone. In the Benedictus we hear at greater length from the soloists – the full quartet this time – and they do well.

The concluding Agnus Dei is a powerful movement. In the first four bars that the basses sing there's a tiny moment in which the singing is just less than unanimous. This is remarkable in that it's the only (and very minor) choral blemish that I noticed throughout the whole performance. The choir and orchestra project the dramatic passages here very strongly and they're just as successful in the much more subdued music for 'Miserere nobis'.

This is a very good performance of Schubert's Mass, which, despite its occasional longueurs, is a fine work. Kubelik conducts with dedication and with fidelity to the score. He's well supported by his singers and orchestra. I'd rank this reading as pretty much on a par with Sawallisch's, which I've admired for many years. The recorded sound is very pleasing. I've only listened to the disc as a conventional CD. Audite explain in a booklet note that the recording is presented on what they call a Listen and Compare basis. This means that on an SACD player "one can hear the unrevised historical archive recording [on separate tracks] following the restored version." I'd advise SACD collectors to read the note in full for themselves.

Anyone who doesn't have a version of this work in his or her collection could do far worse than invest in this recording.

**Frankfurter Rundschau 13. August 2005 ( - 2005.08.13)**

Frankfurter  
Rundschau

**Die drei Wünsche:**

Die drei Wünsche:

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

**Classica-Répertoire Octobre 2005 (Xavier de Gaulle - 2005.10.01)**

Classica<sup>R</sup>  
RÉPERTOIRE

Kubelik, dans ce concert munichois du 22 mars 1968, prend à bras le corps cette...

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

**Classica-Répertoire Novembre 2005 (Philippe van den Bosch - 2005.11.01)**

Classica<sup>R</sup>  
RÉPERTOIRE

**Discophage : les meilleures prises de son**

Discophage : les meilleures prises de son

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

**Diapason Octobre 2005 (Benoît Fauchet - 2005.10.01)**



La Messe en la bémol (1828), chef-d'œuvre de synthèse spirituelle et musicale, jouit d'une discographie luxueuse, presque idéale ; à elle seule, la Radio bavaroise en a fourni deux des interprétations les plus abouties, sous Sawallisch (Emi) puis Giulini (Sony) : à la justesse perpétuelle de ton, fruit d'une approche souple et ductile du premier a répondu la vision très creusée, parfaitement unifiée, du second. Ce live capté quelques années plus tôt ne peut prétendre à une telle postérité, fût-il offert dans un nouveau son, en SACD. Bien installé dans son règne munichois (1961-1979), Kubelik ose une option très personnelle, aérée et articulée, mais qui pose davantage de questions qu'elle n'en résout. Ainsi dès l'entame, cette Messe oppose à l'oreille son esthétique tout en petites césures : pour autant la phrase respire-t-elle, vit-elle vraiment ? Plus loin (Gloria), pourquoi le chœur, qui bonifiera en quelques décennies, propose-t-il ces « Glorificamus te » si verticaux, statiques ? Et nous passons sur le jeu des cordes, étonnamment plus rêches que soyeuses, des fugues par trop empesées ou heurtées, l'intonation un peu problématique (« Miserere » !). Jour sans ? Ce serait occulter les rais de lumière qui traversent de part en part la lecture de Kubelik, comme dans le thème en croix de l'Agnus Dei, qui esquisse des reliefs choraux saisissants (le pupitre de mezzos !). Et le plateau de solistes, bien que peu sollicité dans cette œuvre, est d'une maîtrise remarquable.

**Muzyka21 październik 2005, 10 (63) (Stanisław Lubliński - 2005.10.01)**



Msze nr 6 Schubert skomponował tuż przed śmiercią. Jest to utwór bardzo...

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

**Musicus 3/05 ( - 2005.03.01)**



In dieser live-Aufnahme von 1968 aus dem Herkulesaal München dirigierte Rafael...

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

**American Record Guide March/April 2006 (Koob - 2006.03.01)**



Schubert's sixth and final mass (seventh if you count his German Mass) is his masterpiece in the genre and part of the incredible gush of musical glories from his final months. It gets far fewer performances than it deserves. The work is built on the innovations first seen in his previous A-flat Mass, also from his final years (1826). Both works – especially this one – offer the kind of scope and dimensions characteristic of his great C-major Symphony.

Schubert was certainly familiar with his idol Beethoven's Missa Solemnis and paid tribute to it here. Running nearly an hour, its "heavenly lengths" indeed approach the dimensions of that choral behemoth. But, unlike Beethoven (who didn't care whom he offended), Schubert couldn't bring himself to entirely abandon the strict Viennese church music protocols of the day. So he avoided Beethoven's humanistic overtones, wrote distinctly non-operatic parts for his soloists, and stuck to subdued orchestration that eschewed "frivolous" instruments like flutes. Remember, Schubert was deeply steeped in the classical mass tradition, having sung the best ones by Haydn and Mozart as a Hapsburg Court choirboy under Salieri.

But why look for hints of Beethoven from Schubert's gentle soul? He has left us here what he's best at: broad rivers of long-breathed melody, ingenious modulations, gut-wrenching beauty – and his own sweet sincerity of spirit. No composer captured moods and emotions – including sacred ones – more honestly or effectively than Schubert. Just as he can sound happier, more playful, more lovesick, more agitated, or more depressed than any other, he can sound more pious and reverent as well. Even though Schubert was insecure about his abilities as a contrapuntalist, he achieved sacred drama and solemnity here (and further supported sacred traditions) by means of some very impressive polyphony, especially the massive fugues that end both the Gloria and the Credo.

This account – recorded in concert – is a dream come true. Rafael Kubelik is a Schubertian to the core and taps this ethereal score for every drop of its spiritual exaltation. Chorus, orchestra, and soloists are all caught up in his spiritual spell and perform splendidly. All of the rather subdued solo roles are beautifully handled, but I fell in love with Gundula Janowitz's radiant soprano all over again. Their 'Et incarnatus est' ensemble, not far into the Credo movement – ravishing, gently rocking interlude in 6/8 time – is unforgettable.

This is part of a new Super-Audio series from Audite, dubbed "Listen and Compare". Each release contains two versions of the same recording. One is a sophisticated digital restoration of the original concert tapes,

re-engineered for multi-channel SA; the other – also copied into the SA format – presents the otherwise unrestored historical archive. And therein lies the only fly in the ointment for me. My SA player duly delivered the very lush and detailed restoration in totally ear-pleasing fashion, but wouldn't read the tracks containing the undoctored copy of the source tapes. Having noticed no other defects in my equipment, I hesitate to lay the blame on it. Perhaps the producers of this recording should be aware that some SA players apparently can't handle their product.

But no matter: a sublime masterpiece, sympathetically performed by legendary artists and reproduced in rich, clear sound is always welcome. I'll look forward to future releases from this series.

**Fanfare May/June 2006 (James Reel - 2006.05.01)**

fanfare

Wolfgang Sawallisch recorded all of Schubert's Masses for EMI with the Bavarian Radio Symphony Orchestra and Chorus, and with a starry cast of soloists, but I'll take 1960s Rafael Kubelík over 1970s Sawallisch without hesitation. Kubelík was a consistently interesting conductor, even if he was not consistently successful, and he makes the same Bavarian Radio forces sound more like believers—in Schubert and in God—than did Sawallisch.

This is Schubert's final Mass, completed just weeks before his death, but there's no hint of Requiem about it. It's big and symphonic, but symphonic in the Haydn-Mozart sense; Schubert had to conform to conservative Viennese liturgical strictures that had hardly changed in decades.

Kubelík directs a devotional performance, firm but not overtly dramatic. The soloists are good and the chorus sings well, aside from a few stray moments of unsteadiness (as in the last chord of the Gloria), but its enunciation is often mushy. An example of Kubelík's apt but gentle touch: the woodwind figures that punctuate the solo vocal passages in the Credo have a lovely Viennese lilt. This is not the most gripping performance imaginable, but it is sensitive and effective.

This disc's SACD layer includes a version apparently faithful to the original tapes, and a re-mastered version with various unspecified tweakings. The re-mastered version, not the original, is also on the standard CD layer. The re-mastered audio seems closer and more revealing of detail, but it also makes the violins sound a bit harsher. In every case, it's two-channel sound.

**opushd.net - opus haute définition e-magazine Numéro 1 (Jean-Jacques Millo - 2006.01.23)**



Schubert et la musique sacrée. Voilà un sujet intéressant qui est,...

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

**CD Compact Año 20, Nº 198 Mayo 2006 (Jesús Dini - 2006.05.01)**

Schubert terminó su maravillosa misa en Mi bemol D950 entre junio y julio de...

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

**Audiophile Audition December 2005  
(Gary Lemco - 2005.12.02)**



**Hi-res stereo release of an elegant 1968 performance by Kubelik**

Hi-res stereo release of an elegant 1968 performance by Kubelik

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

**www.SA-CD.net March 30, 2010 (John Miller - 2010.03.30)**



Schubert penned this last, and some would say the greatest, of his sacred works...

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

**levante (A.Gascó - 2005.09.03)**

**El místico Schubert final**

El místico Schubert final

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*



## Gustav Mahler: Das Lied von der Erde

Gustav Mahler

CD aud 95.491

Diapason Septembre 2002 (Jean-Charles Hoffele - 2002.09.01)



Deutsche Gramophon ne permit pas à Kubelik d'enregistrer « Le Chant de la terre », qui aurait constitué le point d'orgue de son cycle Mahler ; la firme hambourgeoise avait confié l'œuvre en 1962 à Jochum (sa seule gravure mahlérienne) et au Concertgebouw, avec Merriman et Haefliger. Dans ce concert de février 1970, Kubelik, selon un parti pris qu'il soutint tout au long de son intégrale, refuse tout pathos, tout morbidité ; il expose la partition en pleine lumière, radiographiant les mises en abyme de l'orchestre mahlérien avec une précision expressive qui donne le vertige. A ce titre, le vaste interlude du lied ultime est exemplaire par sa parfaite limpidité ; l'émotion qu'il dégage ne provient pas d'une surcharge d'affect (comme chez Bernstein ou Walter) mais d'un regard lucide, implacable et néanmoins compatissant.

Porté par cet orchestre éclairé, l'alto de Baker ose un chant rayonnant, débarrassé de toute tentation d'assombrir le timbre (ce qu'elle réussissait admirablement avec Haitink, Philips), magnifié par une petite harmonie et des violons tenus par la direction sostenuto de Kubelik, qui semble omniprésente dans toutes les pupitres de l'orchestre, à tous les instants, distillant une immense musique du chambre. Kmentt, en grande voix, tranchant, héroïque, impressionne durablement et ne pâlit ni devant la beauté absolue de Wunderlich ni devant le « sprechgesang » enflammé de Patzak. Dans la plénitude de son geste, Kubelik entend « Le Chant de la terre » comme une partition ouverture sur l'avenir, tournant les dos aux vastes thrènes funèbres des grandes versions de l'œuvre, sentimentaux et étouffant (Walter, Bernstein, Haitink), minéraux et tragiques (Reiner, Klemperer). Il renouvelle totalement notre vision d'une partition-clé du début du siècle.

Pizzicato 10.2002 (Rémy Franck - 2002.10.01)



### Optimistisches 'Lied von der Erde'

Kubelik hat für die Deutsche Grammophon die Mahler-Symphonien aufgenommen, nicht aber 'Das Lied von der Erde'. Nachdem uns etliche der Liveproduktionen der Symphonien bei 'audite' bereits weitaus mehr begeistert hatten als die Studio-Einspielungen der DG, warteten wir gespannt auf dieses für unsere Ohren nun wirklich neue Tondokument. Und die Begeisterung könnte nicht größer sein: so prächtig hat das Mahler-Orchester in dieser Partitur selten geklungen. Kubelik taucht die Musik völlig unpathetisch in ein gleißendes Licht. Das 'Lied von der Erde' klingt daher unerhört neu: das Orchester ist von stupender Klarheit, fast kammermusikalisch fein ziseliert, von bestechender Reinheit und ohne jede dunkeln Gedanken. Gerade dadurch wirkt Kubeliks Interpretation so anders, so neu: frei von jeglicher Sentimentalität zelebriert er keinen Trauerdienst, sondern gibt Mahlers Musik einen eher optimistischen, in die Zukunft weisenden Charakter. Erstaunlicherweise bleibt sogar Janet Bakers Stimme hier hell und lichtstark, und Waldemar Kmentt - in großer Form - singt ohne Anstrengung, ohne theatralische Geste, sehr stilvoll und ohne jede störende Akzentuierung, weil er in diesem kammermusikalisch transparenten orchestralen Umfeld einen sicheren Platz hat.

Audite legt also mit dieser CD eine in der Interpretationsgeschichte vom 'Lied von der Erde' eine essentielle Interpretation vor, die unsere Sicht auf dieses von Mahler als sein persönlichstes Werk bezeichnete Komposition völlig erneuert.

**Répertoire No 161 (Gérard Belvire - 2002.10.01)**

Avec Bernstein, Solti et Haitink, Kubelik fait partie des chefs « historiques...

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

**Fono Forum 11/02 (Christian Wildhagen - 2002.11.01)**



**Glücksgriff**

Dieser Live-Mitschnitt stellt eine echte Erweiterung der Kubelik-Diskographie dar, denn "Das Lied von der Erde" fehlt in seinem Studio-Mahler-Zyklus. Kubeliks Lesart zählt fraglos zu den bleibenden Einspielungen dieses bewegenden Werks. Ihm standen in Janet Baker und Waldemar Kmentt zwei ausgezeichnete Solisten zur Verfügung. Zwar reicht Kmentt nicht an Fritz Wunderlich heran, doch für eine unretuschierte Live-Aufnahme bewältigt er den schwierigen Tenorpart mehr als achtbar und überzeugt auch durch sensible dynamische Schattierungen. Janet Baker kann sich dagegen durchaus mit Kathleen Ferrier und Christa Ludwig messen, einige wenige Schärfen in der Höhe nicht gerechnet.

**Classic Record Collector 10/2002 (Christopher Breunig - 2002.10.01)**



The German firm Audite has given us not only this near complete live cycle of Mahler symphonies (sans 4 or 8), but valuable Kubelik/Curzon readings of four Mozart and two Beethoven concertos. Of particular interest here is 'Das Lied von der Erde', since Kubelik did not record it for DG. Janet Baker fans will welcome a third CD version: and she sounds truly inspired by her conductor. 'Der Einsame im Herbst' may not have the sheer beauty of the version with Haitink but the finale surpasses most on records, with a real sense of the transcendental at the close. Kmentt too makes the most of his words; and the reedy Munich winds suit this score.

Recorded between 1967 and 1971, Kubelik's DG cycle has been at budget price for some time now and the Audite alternatives of 1, 5 and 7 have been in the shops for months. The NHK-recorded Ninth, made during a 1975 Tokyo visit by the Bavarian RSO, was reviewed in CRC, Spring 2001 (I found the sound unfocused and the brass pinched in sound, but welcomed in particular playing 'ablaze' after the visionary episode in the Rondo burleske and a crowning finale). No. 1 in DG is widely admired but this 1979 version is more poetic still, wonderfully so in the introduction and trio at (II). There is something of a pall of resonance in place of applause, cut from all these Audite transfers. In No. 7 the balance is more airy than DG's multi-miked productions, and (as in No. 5) Kubelik sounds less constrained than when working under studio conditions, although rhythm in the opening bars of (II) goes awry and the very opening note is succeeded by a sneeze! The disturbing and more shadowy extremes are more vividly characterized, the finale a riotous display.

Some critics feel that Kubelik gives us 'Mahler-lite', which may seem in comparison with, say, Chailly's

Decca cycle or the recent BPO/Abbado Third on DG – not to mention Bernstein's. But there is plenty of energy here, and the divided strings with basses set to the rear left give openness to textures. However, the strings are not opulent and the trumpets are often piercing. It would be fair to say that Kubelik conducted Mahler as if it were Mozart!

As it happens, in the most controversial of his readings, No. 6, the DG is preferable to the Audite, where Kubelik projects little empathy with its slow movement and where the Scherzo is less cohesive. The real problem is that the very fast speed for (I) affects all subsequent tempo relationships. Nor does the finale on No. 3, one of the glories of the DG cycle, quite have the same radiance; the singers are the same, the Tölz Boys making a sound one imagines Mahler must have heard in his head, and this performance predates the DG by one month. Nevertheless, these newer issues of Nos 2 and 3 are worth hearing, the 'Resurrection' not least for Brigitte Fassbaender's account of 'Urlicht'.

Nowadays every orchestra visiting London seems to programme Mahler's Fifth Symphony as a showpiece, but in 1951 (when Bruno Walter's 78rpm set was the collector's only choice) a performance would surely have been uncommon even at the Concertgebouw – Mengelberg was prohibited from conducting in Holland from 1946 until he died that year. Although the start of (V) is marred by horns, this is an interesting, well executed account with a weightier sound, from what one can surmise through the inevitable dimness – the last note of (I) is almost inaudible. The three versions vary sufficiently to quote true timings (none is given by Tahra): (I) 11m 34s/12m 39s/11m 35s (Tahra/Audite/DG); (II) 13m/14m 52s/13m 52s; (III) 15m 56s/17m 54s/17m 23s; (IV) 9m 24s/10m 24s/9m 44s; (V) 14m 26s/14m 57s/15m 29s. The live Munich version is tidier than on DG; the spectral imagery in (III) is heavier in effect, too; and in the Adagietto the dynamic and phrasing shadings and poetic quality of the string playing also give the live performance the edge. Towards the end of the finale, and elsewhere, the engineers reduced dynamic levels.

Tahra's booklet comprises an untidily set-out synopsis of Kubelik's career. Audite's have full descriptions of the works with text for Nos 2 and 3, and different back-cover colour portraits of the conductor.

**www.ClassicsToday.com 01.01.1000 (David Hurwitz - 2002.01.01)**



Rafael Kubelik never made a studio recording of Das Lied von der Erde, but even...

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

**klassik-heute.com 02.12.2002 (Mario Gerteis - 2002.12.02)**



In der ersten Mahler-Welle auf (Stereo-)Schallplatten spielte der sinfonische...

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*



Here is one of the great "lost" Mahler recordings now properly restored. When Rafael Kubelik made his outstanding studio Mahler cycle in Munich for DG in the 1970s (463 738-2) he made no version of "Das Lied Von Der Erde" to go with it. This was puzzling for such a great Mahlerian who even went to the trouble of recording the Adagio from the Tenth Symphony as part of his cycle. We knew Kubelik played the work because this performance had taken place in Munich in February 1970 with Kubelik's Bavarian Radio Orchestra and first appeared, minus a minute or two in the fourth movement and in poor sound, on a pirate label in the 1980s. A number of Kubelik's studio Mahler recordings were made after "live" performances in the same hall at this very time (as other Audite releases have shown) so why didn't Kubelik, the orchestra and his two soloists go on to record it for DG under studio conditions? I wonder if the answer lies in the presence of Janet Baker. At that time Baker was an exclusive EMI artist. Were plans afoot for her to record it with Kubelik but these came to nothing because of that? I know she later recorded the work with Bernard Haitink for Philips but that was some years later when perhaps contract problems were resolvable. Whatever, I know that ever since I heard the pirate version of this performance I had hoped that at some point someone would gain access to the Bavarian Radio master tapes and release them. That is what has now happened and this recording of Mahler's late masterpiece now joins a nearly-completed "live" Mahler cycle conducted by Kubelik from various times during his Munich tenure released by Audite.

For me Janet Baker has always been the greatest interpreter of the female/baritone songs in this work. Her Philips recording with Haitink on Eloquence (468 182-2) was long awaited even when it appeared and did not disappoint her admirers. In my survey of recordings of this work I believe I paid that version the attention it deserved singling out Baker for special praise. However even then I felt her interpretation on a BBC Radio Classics release taken from a later "live" performance in Manchester and conducted by Raymond Leppard was even better – deeper, more profound. The problem was that in no way could the BBC Northern Symphony Orchestra compare with the Concertgebouw, or her conductor Raymond Leppard compare with Bernard Haitink even though hearing Baker "live" seemed to add something to her interpretation. This was partly why when I heard the "pirate" of this Munich version I hoped for an official release. This too is "live" with all the benefit that brings but this time we have in Kubelik a Mahlerian of equal stature to Haitink and in the Bavarian Radio an orchestra that comes close to the Concertgebouw in depth of response to Mahler's sound world. Matched with Waldemar Kmentt she also appears with a tenor who is, for me, superior to James King on the Haitink version and John Mitchinson on the Leppard, fine though both are.

The key to the greatness of Janet Baker in this work is her total identification with the words. Her care for every detail of them means she lives the part where some merely describe it. Her view of the music seems from the inside out. In these movements one thinks of Baker, Ludwig and Fassbaender among the women and Fischer-Dieskau among the men. In the second song you are made to feel what it is to be lonely rather than simply have loneliness described to you. Technically too she is on top form as the wild horses passage in "Von der Schönheit" proves. At no point in this crazy music does Baker ever give the impression that she will come to grief, even though the tempo adopted by her and Kubelik is suitably swift. They had one shot at this in front of an audience and it comes off triumphantly. Listen also to the delicacy of the description of the young girls swimming in the same movement. Finally in the "Abschied" her range, emotional and musical is total. Everything is covered here from the passages of sterile enunciation to the overwhelming emotional grandeur of the climaxes and all points between subtly graded. Overall this is one of those interpretations that contain depths that will take years to plumb.

Of all the great recordings of this work I know there has, for me, so far only been one where I feel that two of the greatest interpreters are matched on the same recording. These are Christa Ludwig and Fritz Wunderlich for Klemperer on EMI. But now with this release I think there is a second since Waldemar

Kmentt is just as convincing in his songs as Janet Baker is in hers. In fact I believe Kmentt can be compared with Wunderlich, Peter Schreier and Julius Patzak as the finest interpreters in the tenor songs on record. In "Das Trinklied" Kmentt is towering, challenging the music to break him in the dramatic sections, but emerging unscathed from them. The "Dark is life, is death" refrain has a world-weary depth that few save Schreier and Wunderlich can match and the "ape on the grave" climax is fearless in his nightmarish delivery. Like Baker, Kmentt can also walk the delicate passages of this work with equal effect. His description of the arrival of spring in "Der Trunkene im Fruhling" is magical and his word painting in "Von Der Jugend" piquant and sharp.

Kubelik's greatness as a Mahler conductor was his ability to cover the whole range of the music from uncomplicated nature painting to calculated high drama and seem equally at home everywhere. He attends to all details of this music with care and discretion, always taking care of the bigger picture too, balancing it with the inner detail. Notice the woodwinds during the funeral march in "Der Abscheid" where every strand is clearly delineated, or the effect of getting his mandolin to play tremolo in the same movement marking up the chinoiserie in a most evocative and unique way. He also recognises what I have always believed to be a crucial aspect of this work. That the two soloists are the equal partners with the conductor and that he is there to support them. With great soloists like these, that is easier. But countless examples of his support for his soloists are apparent in this performance along with the preparation of his orchestra to act almost as a third soloist. The purely instrumental passages in "Der Abschied" reveal Mahler conducting of the highest order. Listen to the birds passage and also to the deep bass growls before the funeral march.

The sound recording leaves little to be desired. It is hard to tell it was made over thirty years ago for radio broadcast. I like the balances between woodwind and strings and the warmth of the acoustic around the orchestra and soloists in the chamber-like sections. The balance between soloists and orchestra are exemplary also. Even the distinctive acoustic of the Herkulesaal is made to sound perfectly suited to the music. You can hear everything and with solo players in the orchestra as eloquent as the two singers are this is important and adds another plus to this disc. In sound terms this more than matches the best versions of this work and musically it is the equal of Klemperer on EMI (5 66892 2), Sanderling on Berlin Classics (0094022BC) and Horenstein on BBC Legends (BBCL 4042-2). All very different though each one of those comparable versions are in their interpretative approach. Indeed, this Kubelik recording has the effect of taking many of the virtues of all those great recordings and stitching them into a new and deeply satisfying whole.

This is one of the all-time great Mahler recordings: a classic version of this inexhaustible masterpiece in every way. Indeed I think there are none to surpass it, perhaps only to equal it. You will be moved, delighted and changed by it. I cannot recommend it too highly as it goes to the top of my list for this work.

**Rondo 17.10.202 (Matthias Kornemann - 2002.10.17)**



Viele Dirigenten hat es am Jahrhundertende angezogen, dieses "Lied von der..."

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

[klassik.com](http://klassik.com) 19.12.2002 (Erik Daumann - 2002.12.19)  
source: <http://magazin.klassik.com/reviews/revie...>



### Von Böhme zu Böhme

Von Böhme zu Böhme

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

### Stereoplay 1/2003 (Ulrich Schreiber - 2003.01.01)



Marktpolitisch mag der Audite-Versuch, dem von der DG im Studio fixierten...

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

### Die Rheinpfalz 12.02.2003 (Gerhard Tetzlaff - 2003.02.12)



### Idealer Interpret – Livemitschnitte unter Rafael Kubelik

Idealer Interpret – Livemitschnitte unter Rafael Kubelik

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

### Gramophone 9/2002 (Richard Fairman - 2002.09.01)



### Das Lied live from two great Mahler conductors, more spontaneous sounding than their studio versions

Audite is in the process of assembling a complete Mahler cycle with Kubelík and the Bavarian RSO from radio relays. So far the recordings date across a period of 15 years, with this Das Lied von der Erde, broadcast in February 1970, among the earliest. Kubelík's Mahler is heard here at its most typical, so much at ease with the sound-world and tempo of the music that other conductors can seem heavy-handed by comparison. It is at the other extreme from the explosive collision of emotions that makes Bernstein's recordings so intense and choppy: Kubelík is natural, easy-going, fresh in his delight at the score's exquisite detail. Although the poems of Das Lied refer to several seasons, this performance surely belongs to the spring, when 'the dear earth everywhere blooms... and grows green again'. Waldemar Kmentt is strong and sure in the tenor songs but rather pedestrian. There is not much sense of wide-eyed wonder at the arrival of spring or uninhibited hedonism as the wine is being poured. Dame Janet Baker already features on several other recordings, including a live broadcast on BBC Legends, but no two of her performances of this work were the same. Here, in 1970, she sings with much pure, vocal beauty and a desire for intimacy that is remarkable in a large concert-hall. In the second song the close to each rising phrase is beautifully handled. The fourth song is graceful, though less sensuous than on her Philips recording under Haitink. In the final 'Abschied' the voice truly sails 'wie eine Silberbarke' on hushed legato lines shimmering with intensity.

Some may prefer to stick with studio recordings of Das Lied, where the orchestra has had the luxury of extra takes to polish every detail, but there are no complaints about the Bavarian orchestra here. There are also a few studio recordings (Karajan and the Solti among them) that perform technical somersaults to end

up with a recorded balance less satisfying than here.

**WDR 3 03.12.2002 (Michael Schwalb - 2002.12.03)**



Hörproben-Neue CDs, am Mikrophon Michael Schwalb. Mitgebracht habe ich Ihnen...

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

**Das Orchester 3/2003 (Johannes Killyen - 2003.03.01)**



Um eines von Gustav Mahlers großen Werken neu auf dem übersättigten...

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

**Flensburg Avis 09.04.2003 (Lars Geerdes - 2003.04.09)**



**Skelsættende tysk Mahlerindspilning genudgivet**

*Live-optagelse fra 1970 kan nu købes på cd*

Skelsættende tysk Mahlerindspilning genudgivet

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

**Nordsee-Zeitung Nr. 57/2003 (Sebastian Loskant - 2003.03.08)**



Es war ein Tscheche, der den Münchenern den Spätromantiker Gustav Mahler...

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

**Gramophone October 2003 (Rob Cowan - 2003.10.01)**



**Kubelik takes the Stage**

Some years ago I was involved in a discussion concerning Wilhelm Furtwängler's potential artistic heir. Who might he be? There was no lack of candidates. My suggestion, for the following reasons, was Rafael Kubelik. Both were composers; both preferred an old-fashioned orchestral layout (violins divided, etc) and achieved weight of sonority by allowing a chord to fall naturally rather than slamming it shut. Both favoured flexibility within the bar, an often orgiastic excitability and, most important in this particular context, an overall preference for live performance over recording.

For example, compare Kubelik's 1975 DG studio recording of Beethoven's Fourth Symphony with the Israel Philharmonic with the live Bavarian RSO Audite version of four years later. The IPO account is taut and incisive, with an explosive fortissimo just before the coda (at 5'52", i.e. bar 312) that sounds as if it has been aided from the control desk. Turn then to the BRSO version, the lead-up at around 4'25" to that same passage (here sounding wholly natural), so much more gripping, where second fiddles, violas and cellos thrust their responses to tremolando first fiddles. The energy level is still laudably high but the sense of intense engagement is almost palpable. Again, with the Boston recording of the Fifth, handsome and well played as it undoubtedly is (and with the finale's repeat intact, which isn't the case on Audite), there is little comparison with the freer, airier and more responsive live relay. I'm thinking especially the slow movement, so humble and expressive, almost hymn-like in places – for example, the Bachian string counterpoint from 4'27". Also, the Boston recording places first and second violins on the left: the Audite option has them divided, as per Kubelik's preferred norm.

Audite's Tchaikovsky coupling is an out-and-out winner. Kubelik made two studio recordings of the Fourth Symphony (with the Chicago SO and Vienna PO), both set around a lyrical axis, but this live version has a unique emotive impetuosity, especially in the development section of the first movement. The Andantino relates a burning nostalgia without exaggeration, whereas the scherzo – taken at a real lick – becomes a quiet choir of balalaikas. The April 1969 performance of the Violin Concerto was also Pinchas Zukerman's German début and aside from Kubelik's facilitating responsiveness, there's the warmth and immediacy of the youthful Zukerman's tone and the precision of his bowing. Both performances confirm Kubelik as among the most sympathetic of Tchaikovsky conductors, a genuine listener who relates what he hears, not what he wants to confess through the music.

Much the same might be said of Kubelik's Mahler, whether for DG or the various live alternatives currently appearing on Audite. In the case of 'Das Lied von der Erde' there is no DG predecessor, but even if there was, I doubt that it would surpass the live relay of February 1970 with Waldemar Kmentt and Dame Janet Baker, so dashing, pliant and deeply felt, whether in the subtly traced clarinet counterpoint near the start of 'Von der Jugend' or the way Baker re-emerges after the funereal processional in 'Der Abschied', as if altered forever by a profound visitation.

#### International Record Review 10/2002 (Christopher Breuning - 2002.10.01)



The German firm Audite has given us not only this near complete live cycle of Mahler symphonies (sans 4 or 8), but valuable Kubelik/Curzon readings of four Mozart and two Beethoven concertos. Of particular interest here is 'Das Lied von der Erde', since Kubelik did not record it for DG. Janet Baker fans will welcome a third CD version; and she sounds truly inspired by her conductor. 'Der Einsame im Herbst' may not have the sheer beauty of the version with Haitink but the finale surpasses most on records, with a real sense of the transcendental at the close. Kmentt too makes the most of his words; and the reedy Munich winds suit this score.

Recorded between 1967 and 1971, Kubelik's DG cycle has been at budget price for some time now (Collector 463 738-2, ten discs) and the Audite alternatives of 1, 5 and 7 have been in the shops for months. The NHK-recorded Ninth (Audite 95471), made during a 1975 Tokyo visit by the Bavarian RSO, was reviewed in CRC, Spring 2001 (I found the sound unfocused and the brass pinched in sound, but welcomed in particular playing 'ablaze' after the visionary episode in the Rondo burleske and a crowning finale). No. 1 on DG is widely admired but this 1979 version is more poetic still, wonderfully so in the introduction and trio at (II). There is something of a pal of resonance in place of applause, cut from all these Audite transfers. In No.7 the balance is more airy than DG's multi-miked productions, and (as in No.5) Kubelik sounds less constrained than when working under studio conditions, although rhythm in the opening bars of (II) goes awry and the very opening note is succeeded by a sneeze! The disturbing and more shadowy extremes are more vividly characterised, the finale a riotous display.

Some critics feel that Kubelik gives us 'Mahler-lite' which may seem so in comparison with, say, Chailly's Decca cycle or the recent BPO/Abbado Third on DG – not to mention Bernstein's. But there is plenty of

energy here, and the divided strings with basses set to the rear left give openness to textures. However, the strings are not opulent and the trumpets are often piercing. It would be fair to say that Kubelik conducted Mahler as if it were Mozart!

As it happens, in the most controversial of his readings, No. 6, the DG is preferable to the Audite, where Kubelik projects little empathy with its slow movement and where the Scherzo is less cohesive. The real problem is that the very fast speed for (I) affects all subsequent tempo relationships. Nor does the finale of No. 3, one of the glories of the DG cycle, quite have that same radiance; the singers are the same, the Tölz Boys making a sound one imagines Mahler must have heard in his head, and this performance predates the DG by one month. Nevertheless, these newer issues of Nos 2 and 3 are worth hearing, the 'Resurrection' not least for Brigitte Fassbaender's account of the 'Urlicht'.

Nowadays, every orchestra visiting London seems to programme Mahler's Fifth Symphony as a Showpiece, but in 1951 (when Bruno Walter's 78rpm set was the collector's only choice) a performance would surely have been uncommon even at the Concertgebouw – Mengelberg was prohibited from conducting in Holland from 1946 until he died that year. Although the start of (V) is marred by the horns, this is an interesting, well executed account with a weightier sound, from what one can surmise through the inevitable dimness – the last note of (I) is almost inaudible. The three versions vary sufficiently to quote true timings (none is given by Tahra): (I) 11m 34s/12m 39s/11m 35s (Tahra/Audite/DG); (II) 13m/14m 52s/13m 52s; (III) 15m 56s/17m 54s/17m 23s; (IV) 9m 24s/10m 24s/9m 44s; (V) 14m 26s/14m 57s/15m 29s. The live Munich version is tidier than on DG; the spectral imagery in (III) is heavier in effect, too; and in the Adagietto the dynamic and phrasing shadings and poetic quality of the string playing also give the live performance the edge. Towards the end of the finale, and elsewhere the engineers reduced dynamic levels.

Tahra's booklet comprises an untidily set-out synopsis of Kubelik's career. Audite's have full description of the works with texts for Nos 2 and 3, and different back-cover colour portraits of the conductor.

#### Badische Zeitung 18.11.2003 (Heinz W. Koch - 2003.11.18)

Badische  Zeitung

... Wie spezifisch, ja wie radikal sich Gielens Mahler ausnimmt, erhellt schlagartig, wenn man Rafael Kubeliks dreieinhalb Jahrzehnte alte und vor einer Weile wiederveröffentlichte Einspielung dagegenhält.

Eine gehörige Überraschung gab's schon einmal – als nämlich die nie veröffentlichten Münchner Funk-„Meistersinger“ von 1967 plötzlich zu haben waren. Jetzt ist es Gustav Mahlers drei Jahre später eingespieltes „Lied von der Erde“, das erstmals über die Ladentische geht. Es gehört zu einer Mahler Gesamtaufnahme, die offenbar vor der rühmlich bekannten bei der Deutschen Grammophon entstand. Zumindest bei den hier behandelten Sinfonien Nr. 3 und Nr. 6 war das der Fall. Beim „Lied von der Erde“ offeriert das Symphonie-Orchester des Bayerischen Rundfunks, dessen Chef Kubelik damals war, ein erstaunlich präsent, erstaunlich aufgesplittertes Klangbild, das sowohl das Idyllisch-Graziöse hervorkehrt wie das Schwerblütig-Ausdrucksgesättigte mit großem liedsinfonischem Atem erfüllt – eine erstrangige Wiedergabe.

Auch die beiden 1967/68 erarbeiteten Sinfonien erweisen sich als bestechend durchhörbar. Vielleicht geht Kubelik eine Spur naiver vor als die beim Sezieren der Partitur schärfer verfahrenen Dirigenten wie Gielens, bricht sich, wo es geht, das ererbte böhmische Musikantentum zumindest für Momente Bahn. Da staunt einer eher vor Mahler, als dass er ihn zu zerlegen sucht. Wenn es eine Verwandtschaft gibt, dann ist es die zu Bernstein. Das Triumphale der „Dritten“, das Nostalgische an ihr wird nicht als Artefakt betrachtet, sondern „wie es ist“: Emotion zur Analyse. ...

(aus einer Besprechung mit den Mahler-Interpretationen Michael Gielens)

www.buch.de 08.07.2002 (Olaf Behrens - 2002.07.08)

buch.de

Bisher sind nur Live-Einspielungen der Werke Mahlers unter Rafael Kubelik...

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

www.new-classics.co.uk January 2005 ( - 2005.01.01)

new classics

In this outstanding live recording dating from 1970, Rafael Kubelik conducts the Bavarian Radio Symphony Orchestra in Mahler's Das Lied von der Erde ('The Song of the Earth'). In this exciting performance of the symphony for tenor and alto voices, the soloists are the superb Janet Baker and Waldemar Kmentt. A full English text is included with the CD. 'The polyphony of timbres at the work's conclusion will be remembered as one of the greatest and most moving achievements of Rafael Kubelik and his orchestra' - Suddeutsche Zeitung.

Scherzo N° 178, Septiembre 2003 (Enrique Pérez Adrián - 2003.09.01)

sch~~er~~zo

Una gran versión que sin duda hará mella espiritual en cualquier oyente sensible que se acerque a ella

*Mathis, Brendel, Kmentt, Baker y Kubelik - Dos nuevas dianas*

Una gran versión que sin duda hará mella espiritual en cualquier oyente sensible que se acerque a ella

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

The New York Sun April 16, 2008 (Benjamin Ivry - 2008.04.16)

The NEW YORK Sun

In Stephen Sondheim's 1970 musical "Company," Elaine Stritch raspily sang a...

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

[The Jewish Daily Forward](#) July 28, 2010 (Benjamin Ivry - 2010.07.28)



### A Lively Musical Corpus

*Gustav Mahler, Almost a Century Dead and Still Kicking*

A Lively Musical Corpus

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

**CD Compact n°169 (octobre 2003) (Benjamín Fontvelia - 2003.10.01)**

### Rafael Kubelik/Audite

Rafael Kubelik/Audite

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

**ClicMag N° 10s Novembre 2013 (Jérôme Angouillant - 2013.11.01)**



Deux figures légendaires de l'interprétation mahlérienne réunies à l'occasion d'un concert à Munich pour l'oeuvre peut-être la plus intime et douloureuse de Mahler: « Le chant de la terre ».

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

**Lippische Landeszeitung 05.02.2004 (fla - 2004.02.05)**



### Historische Aufnahme ausgezeichnet

*Label aus Hiddesen bekommt Cannes Classical Award*

Historische Aufnahme ausgezeichnet

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

[El País](#) 19.04.2003 (Javier Pérez Senz - 2003.04.19)

El País

### Kubelik, en el corazón de Mahler

*Dos sinfonías de Gustav Mahler grabadas en vivo abren la edición que el sello Audite dedica al director checo Rafael Kubelik, uno de los grandes mahlerianos de la historia.*

[...] dirige el célebre adagietto con un encendido lirismo y una intensidad que hipnotiza al oyente –, situándose entre las mejores de la discografía.

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

[www.amazon.de](#) 1. Oktober 2002 ( - 2002.10.01)

source: <https://www.amazon.de/gp/customer-review...>

amazon

### Fernöstliche Musik ganz nah!

Rafael Kubelik beschreitet sicher den Grat zwischen romantisch üppigem Klang und klassischer Genauigkeit, lässt die Musik weit schwingen, das Orchester großartig ausspielen. Die Solisten sind für diese Partien ideal und mit genauem Gespür besetzt. Ergreifend, aber nie sentimental.

[www.amazon.de](#) 8. Mai 2019 ( - 2019.05.08)

source: <https://www.amazon.de/product-reviews/B0...>

amazon

### Could this be the only Das Lied you'll ever need? Probably!

Please allow me to get the caveats out of the way before I say why I think this might be the only Das Lied you'll ever need: I'm very much a lay person when comes to appreciating classical music so I can only speak from the perspective of how I experience the music rather than being able to comment on the technical merit of the performance; and, I'm a relative newcomer when it comes to Mahler. I only came across Mahler a few years ago and although I regard his 2nd and 3rd symphonies as the joint-best symphonies I've ever heard, I've barely scratched the surface when it comes to listening to symphonies by any other composer, and I've barely scratched the surface when it comes to exploring the many reading of this particular symphony of songs (I've only heard six or seven).

So why do I think this might be the only Das Lied you'll ever need? The answer is simple: intimacy. This is the only version of this piece of music I've heard that seems to have been played to and for the listener rather than at the listener. Whether that's because of how it was recorded or performed I couldn't say. Perhaps it's a combination of both. All I know is, is that when Janet Baker and Waldemar Kmentt sing, although especially when Janet is singing, I feel as though they're singing to and for the listener, which in my case, is me. The goes for the orchestra: when they play, I feel as though they're playing to and for me.

There are probably many other recordings out there that sound better, clearer, less polluted by background noise. But I really feel that what is lost in audio quality with it being a live recording is gained in spades in musicality.

Like I say, I don't have the knowledge and experience to critique this performance from a technical point of view. I just want to confirm what others have said: that this is a genuine 5-star version of Das Lied... and probably the only one you'll ever need!

I should add, that although Herreweghe's reading (the Schoenberg-Riehn transcription) comes close in terms of that sense of intimacy, without Janet Baker on vocals, however, it just can't compete with this under-appreciated masterpiece.

**www.amazon.de 6. August 2019 ( - 2019.08.06)**  
**source: <https://www.amazon.de/product-reviews/B0...>**



**Completely outstanding**

This is now my favourite Lied von der Erde. Everything seems right: soloists just superb, orchestra wonderfully transparent, ideal recording, with the advantage of being live. Don't miss it.

